

Dear State House Representatives and State Senators,

We write today to bring your attention to the incredible amount of misinformation being spread through traditional and social media by Enbridge Energy, the Michigan Chamber of Commerce, American Petroleum Institute, an oil industry front group Consumer Energy Alliance, and other oil industry allies. While we can't begin to equal the amount of money that these groups are spending in efforts to frame the debate around the future of Line 5 and influence Governor Whitmer and other state leaders, facts are stubborn things, and are overwhelmingly on our side in this case. We want you to have the facts at hand rather than just the advertisements and talking points that are currently being spread.

False Claim: Enbridge and allies claim a Straits oil tunnel will create thousands of jobs, and that thousands of jobs in Ohio and Michigan refineries would be lost if Line 5 were to be decommissioned.

The Truth: According to their own website, Enbridge employs 96 Michigan residents, including both regular employees and contractors.¹ They have also admitted that most jobs associated with a tunnel build would likely not go to Michigan residents, stating in response to the Dynamic Risk Alternatives Analysis, "...the positive economic impacts to Michigan are overstated. The type and complex nature of either alternative would likely drive the need for specific equipment and contractors likely not currently available in the State of Michigan."² Further, in a June 24, 2019 presentation to the Marysville City Council, Enbridge Representative Lara Hamsher stated that in the project to replace Line 5 across the St. Clair River, "[Enbridge] would like to source jobs from local union halls, but we have to make sure that the individuals for this project are specially trained." In Enbridge's own words--they can't guarantee they will employ local union labor.³

False Claim: Line 5 is the only feasible way to supply needed propane to the Upper Peninsula.

The Truth: According to US Census data, roughly only 18% of the homes in the UP use propane heating. Three main sources supply propane for those users. The Plains All American Propane Storage Facility at Kincheloe provides propane that is brought in by rail from the Canadian Sault to eastern UP households. Propane for the western UP is mainly trucked in from Wisconsin. About 12,000 homes in the central UP rely on propane from Line 5 which is offloaded in Rapid River and transported from there by truck to central UP users.

¹ <https://www.enbridge.com/projects-and-infrastructure/economic-benefit-pages/michigan>

²

<https://www.enbridge.com/~media/Enb/Documents/Projects/line5/Enbridge%20Comments%20to%20Draft%20Dynamic%20Risk%20Alternative%20Analysis%20for%20the%20Straits%20Pipeline%204%20Aug%202017.pdf?la=en>, page 8

³ <http://www.cityofmarysvillemi.com/city-council/city-council-meetings>

The Dynamic Risk Line 5 Alternatives Study provided feasible options for replacing that capacity including building a new 4 inch NGL pipeline from Superior, WI to Rapid River, MI, using 1-2 rail cars per day to ship propane to the Rapid River storage facility, and using 4-5 trucks per day to ship propane to the Rapid River storage facility.⁴ Further, a recent study from London Economics International demonstrates that if Line 5 were to be shut down immediately through rupture or government action, the effect on UP propane consumers would be a temporary price increase of approximately \$0.05 per gallon.⁵

False Claim: Decommissioning Line 5 without an oil tunnel replacement would result in massive layoffs at refineries in Michigan and Ohio,⁶ refinery closures, and gas price hikes.

The Truth: Refineries in Detroit and Toledo have dramatically reduced their refining capacity for light crude (which is carried by Line 5) and increased their refining capacity for heavy crude (which is transported mainly through Line 78 (formerly Line 6B)) over the last four years.⁷ Scare tactics referencing massive layoffs at these facilities due to a Line 5 closure have no basis in reality.

Enbridge and fossil-fuel industry allies have a track record of false and unsubstantiated claims and lack of transparency. The numbers are overinflated and simply do not substantiate claims about job loss; they falsely claim that three refineries (Detroit Marathon and the two Toledo refineries), and by extension all the jobs there, are fully and wholly dependent on Line 5. The refineries supposedly affected are:

- Marathon – Detroit - primarily uses dilbit, which Line 5 does not carry.
- BP-Husky-Toledo – carries no Line 5 feedstock because it's a tar sands refinery that takes feedstock from Line 78 (formerly Line 6B).
- PBF-Toledo - PBF states in its 2018 annual report for stockholders that it “processes a slate of light crude oils from Canada, the Mid-continent and the U.S. Gulf Coast.”⁸

Gas price spikes in Michigan would not occur due to a Line 5 shut down either. According to a London Economics International study from 2018, if Line 5 were shut down, gas prices in Michigan might jump by a fraction of one cent per gallon - well within normal price fluctuations.⁹

⁴ Dynamic Risk Assessment Systems Alternatives Analysis for the Straits Pipelines, Prepared for the State of Michigan, 2017.

⁵ http://blog.nwf.org/wp-content/blogs.dir/11/files/2018/07/LEI-Enbridge-Line-5-Michigan-Propane_7_27_2018.pdf

⁶ <http://flowforwater.org/fact-check-when-line-5-shuts-down-detroit-jets-will-still-fly-and-union-refinery-jobs-will-still-exist/> ; Gary Street PE provided critical information to FLOW in preparing this analysis about the reliance of Line 5 for Ohio refineries jobs and Detroit Metro Airport jet fuels needs.

⁷ <https://www.groundworkcenter.org/userfiles/filemanager/gl36zkfbj4sfkzfnfzv/>

⁸ <https://investors.pbfenergy.com/~media/Files/P/PBF-Energy-IR-V2/documents/annual-reports-and-proxy/pbf-energy-2018-annual-report.pdf>

⁹ <https://www.nwf.org/Home/Latest-News/Press-Releases/2018/09-12-18-Decommissioning-Line-5>

False Claim: Decommissioning Line 5 will lead to jet fuel shortages at Detroit Metro Airport. In a June 17th letter to Michigan Governor Gretchen Whitmer, Ohio Governor Mike DeWine claimed, “our refineries supply the majority of aviation fuels to Detroit Metro Airport” and asserted shutdown of Line 5 would lead to airline schedule disruptions.

The Truth: Jet fuel consumption at Detroit Metro in 2020 will total 1,658,000 gallons per day, according to a 2010 estimate by the airport.¹⁰ If the three refineries close as DeWine claims, the impact would be a reduction of 150,000 gallons per day of the fuel consumed at the airport, based on the assumption that a whopping 50% of their daily production is used at Metro. That is only about 9% of the total, not the majority as DeWine asserts. This would be easily made up by replacement supplies from other refineries transported through alternative pipelines.

In conclusion, it is critical that you, as Michigan’s elected leaders, have the facts straight when it comes to this key Great Lakes issue. As Michiganders, we are defined by the Great Lakes and we will be remembered by how we stood up for these waters that hold 20 percent of the planet’s fresh surface water. By doing nothing, we are risking the Great Lakes ecosystem, our drinking water, and our regional economy all for the benefit of a foreign oil company, which continues to use its vast financial resources to bully Michigan leaders into allowing this untenable situation to continue.

If you have any questions concerning Line 5, or would like to discuss the facts included in this letter, or ways that you can help support our position, please reach out to any of our organizations for assistance.

Thank you,

Conan Smith, Michigan Environmental Council

Jane TenEyck, Chippewa Ottawa Resource Authority

Kate Madigan, Michigan Climate Action Network

Mary Brady-Enerson, Clean Water Action

Anne Woiwode, Sierra Club Michigan Chapter

Liz Kirkwood, FLOW For Love of Water

Joanne Cromley, Straits Area Concerned Citizens for Peace, Justice, and the Environment

Greg Reisig and June Thaden, Northern Michigan Environmental Action Council

¹⁰ https://www.metroairport.com/sites/default/files/business_documents/masterplans_2009archive/04_-_demand_capacity_facility_requirements_2-16-10.pdf

Judy Karandjeff, Michigan League of Women Voters

Leonard Page, Mackinac Straits Alliance

Jenya Polozova, Food and Water Watch

Bill Latka, TC350

Jim Lively, Groundwork Center for Resilient Communities

Sean McBrearty, Oil and Water Don't Mix