

**STATE OF MICHIGAN
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS
CORPORATIONS, SECURITIES & COMMERCIAL LICENSING BUREAU
2501 Woodlake Circle, Okemos, Michigan 48864-5955**

REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS

APPROVED MEETING MINUTES

December 4, 2012

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Board of Real Estate Appraisers met in Regular Session on December 4, 2012, at the Department of Licensing and Regulatory Affairs, Corporations, Securities & Commercial Licensing Bureau, 2501 Woodlake Circle, Conference Room 1, Okemos, Michigan. The business meeting was called to order by Vice Chairperson, Norman Thomas, at 9:09 a.m.

ROLL CALL

Present:	Darius Dynkowski	Public Member
	Lisa Burroughs	Public Member
	Karen Myers	Professional Member
	Brian Kirksey	Professional Member
	John Snyder	Professional Member
	Norman Thomas	Professional Member
	Diana Meyer	Professional Member
Absent:	David Molenaar	Professional Member
	Patricia Kelly	Public Member
Staff:	Andrew Brisbo	Acting Licensing Director
	Jennifer Fitzgerald	Assistant Attorney General
	Mike Beamish	Licensing Manager
	Felicia Badger	Licensing Analyst
	Reid Williams	Licensing Secretary
	Belinda Wright	Licensing Manager
	Brian Sydnor	Licensing Manager
	Ivory Bennett	Licensing Analyst

ADDITIONS TO OR DELETIONS FROM AGENDA

The stipulation for Mark Smythe, item 4) A) 1), has been removed from the agenda.

Add Election of Officers under Items for Consideration from Board Members or Department, under item 7a.

APPROVAL OF PREVIOUS MINUTES HELD SEPTEMBER 25, 2012

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Kirksey and supported by Ms. Myers that the minutes from the meeting held September 25, 2012 be approved. The motion carried by

unanimous vote.

NEW BUSINESS

STIPULATIONS

LISA MARIE RITTENBERRY, 12-01-003811, C#317495

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Burroughs to accept the stipulation as prepared. The motion did not carry due to lack of support. The Stipulation has been rejected.

BRADLEY EDWARD TARNOPOL, 12-01-068739, C#317737

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Burroughs and supported by Ms. Meyer to accept the stipulation as prepared. The motion carried by unanimous vote. Mr. Kirksey and Mr. Dynkowski abstained from the vote.

HASSAN M. SOBH, 12-01-006884, C#318269

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Burroughs and supported by Ms. Meyer to accept the stipulation as prepared. The motion carried by unanimous vote. Mr. Kirksey abstained from the vote.

AMY RUTH OLDFORD, 12-01-069061, C#318506

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Burroughs and supported by Ms. Myers to accept the stipulation as prepared. The motion carried by unanimous vote. Mr. Kirksey abstained from the vote.

DANIEL MARK BENJAMIN, 12-01-001146, C#316126 & C#316127

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Burroughs and supported by Mr. Snyder to accept the stipulation as prepared. The motion carried by majority vote. Mr. Thomas, Mr. Snyder, Ms. Burroughs, and Ms. Meyer voted Aye. Mr. Kirksey, Mr. Dynkowski, and Ms. Myers abstained from the vote.

HEARING REPORTS

None.

PETITIONS

ALPAY ONDER, 12-01-005837

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Kirksey and supported by Mr. Dynkowski to approve Alpay Onder's petition for reinstatement. The motion carried by majority vote. Ms. Meyer voted no.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

PUBLIC COMMENT

ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION FROM BOARD MEMBERS OR DEPARTMENT

ELECTION OF OFFICERS

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Dynkowski and supported by Mr. Snyder to elect David Molenaar as Chairperson. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Thomas and supported by Ms. Meyer to elect Brian Kirksey as Vice Chairperson. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Kirksey and supported by Mr. Dynkowski to advise the Department to reinstate including all the documents that have been provided in the past for Stipulations and Hearing Reports in the board packet for future meetings. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

2013 MEETING SCHEDULE APPROVAL

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Kirksey and supported by Ms. Myers to approve the 2013 meeting schedule as March 19, June 11, September 24, and December 3. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

ADJOURNMENT (NEXT MEETING DATE – TUESDAY, MARCH 19, 2013)

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Kirksey and supported by Ms. Burroughs to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried by unanimous vote.

There being no further business at this time, the meeting was adjourned at 11:09 a.m.

 / S /
David Molenaar, Chairperson

 3-19-2013
Date

 / S /
Janielle Houston, Recording Secretary

 3-19-2013
Date